

WEST HAVEN BOARD OF EDUCATION MINUTES
June 16, 2010
Special Board Meeting

A Special Meeting of the Board for the Discussion and Action on the Board of Education's Temporary Relocation to Yale West Campus and Discussion and Action to Distribute the RFP regarding Facility Management was held at the Blake Building, 25 Ogden Street, West Haven, CT on June 16th at 6:00 PM. The meeting opened with a pledge to the flag. The meeting was called to order at 6:05 PM by Chairman, Howard Horvath.

BOARD MEMBERS

IN ATTENDANCE:

Howard Horvath Jr., Chairman
T. Sean Maher, Vice Chairman
Eric Murillo, Secretary/Treasurer
Dorinda Borer
M. Toni Paine
Mark Palmieri
Rob Saley

BOARD MEMBERS ABSENT:

Andrew DePalma
Patrick Egolum

ADMINISTRATORS PRESENT: Neil Cavallaro, Superintendent of Schools
Dave Cappetta, Director of Finance

CITY OFFICIALS PRESENT: Mayor John Picard

Howard Horvath stated that we are here tonight for the discussion and action on the Board of Education's temporary relocation to the Yale West Campus and the discussion and action to distribute the RFP regarding facility management. We will be having a 20 minute public session and I am inviting anyone who would like to address the board to come forward.

Public Session

Nancy Rossi, 12 Robin Road, West Haven thanked Rob Saley for the spread sheet he forwarded her. She has some questions for Mr. Saley which he promised will be answered tonight. Where is the breakdown for the ADA Compliance and why is it exactly the same for Thompson and Molloy? Thompson already has an elevator.

Office furniture, is that to move it because the BOE has office furniture. Also with the furniture component, what is the cost to buy furniture when the BOE moves from the Yale campus to City Hall. The cost should be part of the spreadsheet, unless they are storing the furniture and then the storage cost should be part of the spreadsheet.

Why do we have to pay 6,000 to make Yale West ADA Compliant? Shouldn't that be the responsibility of the owner/Yale?

I hope this is not a rushed meeting tonight. Every line item should be gone over in detail in public and not little meetings behind closed doors.

If this move to Yale takes place and there really is a savings, where will the money be spent? This is extremely upsetting. Not only to me but to many other people. We have closed 3 schools and laid off staff and teachers, you violated your own policy, now you want to move to Orange and prioritize and then you eventually will want to come back and ask for money to bond for a high school. Do you really think the people in the Molloy district will be OK with that I don't even know about the rest of the city. It is time we took a better look at this stuff. I'm all for saving money but I still have a real problem with locking the parents out to move to Orange and that is what you are doing. You heard the gentlemen from my district who doesn't even have a car. If he has to go to the administrative office how is he supposed to get there; hire a cab – is somebody going to come and get him? I guess I really want to know who is going to be held responsible when all these wonderful new innovative ideas don't work and are we ever going to come back if we eventually move to Orange. Everybody says yes now but they want to go to City Hall but will we still be sitting here three years from now because I know I will be – unless something happens to me – I do look both ways when I cross the street. It is upsetting and you have disrupted everyone and now you are going to privatize and disrupt the rest of the staff.

The spread sheet should have been sent to the City Council also. I am the finance chair and a member of the city council and I think that when it is something this important and Ken Carney sent it to Mr. Saley at 6:24 on June the 15th and was quoted in the paper – as a City Council member and the Finance Chair I shouldn't have to read about it in the paper. You knew I was interested in this and not only myself but all 13 of us. If we are going to work together as a team you don't exclude people. Thank you.

The board gave thanks.

Robert Guthrie, 11 Spruce Peak Lane, West Haven gave his presentation and it follows on the next page.

Dear Superintendent Cavallaro and Members of the Board of Education

First, I will keep my comments brief. I am concerned about open government and the public's right to know. Although you complied with FOI regulations tonight's meeting seems to be pulled as a fast one. 6pm on a Wednesday the week before school ends? Although a public session is not a requirement I think your limit of 20 minutes on such an important topic is not fair to the residents. If you do not have the time to listen to us, the public, the parents, the taxpayers please step down.

Less than ten days ago you could not act on the items before you tonight because you did not have all the information? How did you properly evaluate all your options with spreadsheets on cost within 10 days? You have already cancelled next week's regular meeting in favor of Monday June 28. Why the special meeting? I am concerned this board of education is not working together as nine collective members. It appears that individual members are pursuing individual interests.

Page 2

Remember, only the Chairman is empowered to act when you are not in session. Individual board members have NO power what so ever outside a meeting. I hope all the fact presented tonight were gathered by the staff you employ and not any board member acting outside their authority. I would hope all of you would be open to all options and not be pushing your individual belief or opinion.

In closing, I would ask you not to relocate out of town. Relocate to a property you already own and is easily accessible, both for public transportation and handicap accessibility, Thompson School. One question, how much will your liability insurance increase by any move to Yale West Campus ? Please do not tell me it will not since you are self insured. It will increase since now you need to indemnify another agency—Yale University. If you believe it will not increase someone does not have all the facts. I made a call, within city hall, verify my facts. I hope you are presented with the facts tonight

A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "Bob Hutton".

The board gave thanks.

Dave Orio, 375 Captain Thomas Blvd. was wondering where the money is coming from for this management team was it budget or where are you getting it from. Our group (union) is concerned about the trickle down effect from what is going on in New Haven. During these financially difficult times I think the public servant goes under valued and I think we provide a service to the community. We have a lot of old schools in this system and they still look pretty good due to the hard work and sweat by our employees. I hope some of the savings that you are talking about aren't going to come on the backs of our employees like New Haven is doing right now.

The board gave thanks.

There were no further speakers and public session closed at 6:15 PM.

Howard Horvath went over the format for the rest of the agenda. He stated we are looking for a motion, a second (if there is a second) and then there will be a discussion that can last as long as it needs to last. During this process I would ask that you direct the questions and comments through the Chair and then we would vote and then move to the next issue.

Dorinda and Eric asked questions about the reason for a motion and second and then discussion rather than discussion first followed by a motion, second and vote. Toni Paine and Howard Horvath said you have to make the motion first and have it seconded before discussion. They were told you can always amend the motion if you want to.

Howard Horvath then entertained a motion on item #2 the board of education's temporary relocation to the Yale West Campus.

Toni Paine made the motion

Rob Saley seconded the motion

Discussion: A lengthy discussion ensued among all board members, Neil Cavallaro, Mayor Piccard, Mr. Ken Carney and Mr. Ray Mulligan. Toni Paine said after looking at the figures a temporary move that would save us money which we could use to hopefully bringing back 3 or 4 teachers and I am in favor of it. Mr. Murillo said the agenda says discussion and action and he has received the figures and thought we were to discuss the figures and how we feel about them and then we act on them. Now you turn the cards on action and discussion. I was told we were going to discuss the figures and then vote on it. Howie said that is what we are doing so please raise any question, comments or concerns.

Rob Saley said the figures have been done by Mr. Carney and he knows there are some issues with some of the figures and asked Mr. Carney to come up and explain them because there are some discrepancies and some issues here. Rob asked Mr. Carney to explain what has transpired since the last time they talked and an Excel Spread Sheet was needed. He asked him to explain what all the numbers reflect. Mr. Carney addressed the board. He stated the numbers reflect the

actual costs representing the different moves. We have four options; stay at Blake - \$368,533.00 and so on down the list. He researched these numbers, proved the numbers, talked to utility companies, pulled invoices and was prepared to answer questions. (I have attached the list to the minutes Exhibit A). Various questions were asked about the listing and Mr. Carney made the following responses. The Yale proposal is broken up into two parts one is utilities and the other is for building maintenance. He was asked about the \$6,000 Mrs. Rossi talked about. Mr. Carney said he was told early on that Yale would provide a \$6,000 key fob to the building and he has not seen that in writing or heard about it so he put it in the column of potential costs to be accurate. If it is provided in writing to us as part of the lease it will come out of the column. Rob asked him why the ADA compliance cost is the same at Thompson and Molloy as Thompson has an elevator. Thompson has different issues. Mr. Carney discussed them and they are included in Exhibit B. Attached is Exhibit B which reflects the cost to make repairs at Molloy and Thompson. Mr. Carney gave a lengthy presentation regarding the costs to renovate the schools.

Rob Saley said we have 35 or 38 people in the Blake Building currently what is the total usage of the Blake Building in sq. feet – 18,000 or 20,000? Mr. Carney estimates we utilize about 10,000 square feet. You can do what you do in the Blake Building with 10,000 square feet. The halls at Blake are very large and are not utilized for anything. A basement is utilized for services other than Administrative operation – materials coming in etc. the rooms aren't well laid out so realistically you use about \$10,000 square feet. Rob said Yale's lease reflects 11,900 sq. feet so how are we going to use 17,000 sq. feet at City Hall. Are we putting more people there? Mr. Carney said we never said the board was going to use 17,000 square feet. How much are we looking at over there and is the 1.3 million we are getting from the state is that going to be architectural services for the 17,000 square feet. Mr. Carney said you don't need 17,000 square feet. The actual need of space depends on the final plan and there will be a lot of input for that plan from the BOE, council etc. A few thousand square feet can go back to City Hall (perhaps the building department or economic development) but that plan hasn't been developed yet. A further discussion ensued.

Rob stated that with the two schools that have been closed he has heard a lot of concerns about not enough custodial people to take care of the business because of the shortage with people retiring. Where are we going with this? Neil said we just finished up placing all our custodial people. The early retirements did save us some money so we were able to bring some people back. Part of what one of the custodian's daily responsibility will be to do deliveries, ordering, stopping by Molloy and Thompson and walking the buildings, going to the Yale West Campus to do minor custodial work (emptying trash cans and those kinds of things). Rob asked if we have enough people with the layoffs. Neil said the union has given us some very good suggestions and we are bringing people back and we believe we will have enough people to operate our facilities.

Rob asked about the time line portion of Exhibit A and was told that was how long the proposed ADA Compliance work would take. Rob asked when we will be going to City Hall. He has heard a lot of time frames; 1 yr, 2 yrs, etc. and wants Mr. Carney to be on the record, and give or take a couple of months, when will we be there if all the ducks were in a row. After a lengthy discussion the final answer was 2 years would be a worst case scenario and 1 year a best.

Sean Maher asked if window units at Thompson for AC would suffice or are roof units absolutely necessary. Due to the lack of offices with walls to contain the air window units would not work. Sean understands there would be a change of lighting due to the cubicle environment and asked of the possibility of desk lamps etc. You have to plug those desk lamps into something. Sean asked if Mr. Carney's estimates for the changeover to Thompson and Molloy were based on the present square footage of the school or the amount of square footage we will be using. The issue at Thompson is that he applied gas bill for the entire school because you aren't going to heat only half the school that is not an option. You have to assume the cost of running that building you can't just carve out 10,000 square feet. However the \$150,000 speaks to 10,000 sq. feet of minor renovation.

Sean asked if other spaces in town had been explored. The high school has only 1,000 square feet and won't work. In the schools we would have to apply the same renovations to make them into a safe, comfortable work environment for the employees. We don't have any Admin space available. Sean asked about the \$50,000 cost for office furniture at Molloy and Thompson. Mr. Carney said this speaks specifically to a pre-wired cubical that facilitates one person for their computer and their electrical needs. In the absence of walls we can't run extension cords to power these units. Sean thought there were some wired walls there at Molloy. Neil said some were upstairs in the tech room. Mr. Carney doesn't know if they are pre-wired but they aren't going to help out in a system where you need 40 desks and tons of walls. A further discussion about the handicapped bathroom and its placement ensued.

Dorinda asked how this moved from a facilities subcommittee meeting where we were studying all this to a full board meeting with a vote; without having another subcommittee meeting so we could look at it and digest it. Howie said to your point we have been studying this for awhile and at the last meeting decided we were missing some information and it was provided and it was just explained. We are here to discuss it further if you like. Rob Saley said we did discuss it last time and said we would have a meeting in the near future. His point was he spent a lot of time with Mr. Carney going over a lot of number the past three months and it was his decision to say to the chairman that I can't get this out of committee and if the board as a whole isn't going to discuss it I would rather see it in the board for them to discuss and vote on. That was his decision. Dorinda thought this was a little unusual because we have a subcommittee in place to vote to take it out of subcommittee to bring it to the full board – right?

Mayor Picard said he was not going to comment on the process but this has been going on for over a year and I know there have been a lot of numbers going back and forth. Yale came to see me about a month ago and there are a couple of things we can all agree on. The Blake Building needs help and it probably shouldn't opened and shouldn't be used it is not handicapped accessible it has a lot of issues. They offered Yale West to us it is not on the table forever. You can decide to deny it which I think would be a huge mistake and be a detriment to our children and a lot of other people for the things they are offering or you can continue to table it and in that case Yale is going to say thank you but no thank you. Yale has been pretty generous.

This has been discussed back and forth and I'm not telling you to support it or not to support it I'm telling you I support it and I think they have been extremely generous to us in what they are doing here but make a decision. I don't think it is fair in my view Yale has extended their

hospitality and said we are pretty much going to charge you only expenses and they have already funneled money to us in so many ways. Everybody but Mrs. Borer was on that bus and lit up like a Christmas tree when they talked about it. We have 120 scientists at Yale West and the opportunities we have are great. You are going to save money. You need to move here. You need to be downtown eventually and I think that will definitely happen. I won't get into your procedure but if you don't make a decision in the very near future Yale is going to make it for you.

Dorinda reiterated that she plans her weeks around these meetings and she was just wondering how it happened.

She appreciated the Mayor's comments and she knows everybody was excited about moving to Yale I don't think anybody is opposed to Yale but she thinks the landscape has changed since that original bus trip. We closed two schools and I think we want to be comfortable that there is not available space now that we have done that. When Yale came they promised us 1,000 jobs and there are 54 jobs there and Mayor Picard interjected don't say something that is inaccurate. Mrs. Borer said let me finish you can comment when I am done. I think there is room over there and I don't think they are going to run out of room tomorrow.

Mayor Picard said Yale didn't promise us anything. Let's be very clear about that and I didn't promise anything and not deliver. Yale said over the next 10, 20, 30 years there were going to be 3,000 to 4,000 jobs and he didn't promise them to you Mrs. Borer or to anyone else. They promised to have them and Yale is already in the process of doing that. I think we are extremely fortunate but let's be very clear. Yale didn't promise me or you 1,000 or 3,000 jobs to anybody. What they promised was is what they are doing. They have scientists coming, they have researchers coming in and over the next 10 years we are hoping we will have 3,000 plus jobs here that we never had. What was also told to Mayor Picard by Bruce Alexander is that Yale does not give away an inch of space so if anybody doesn't understand the benefit that Yale provides this region they are sorely underestimating what Yale brings to the table. They have been extremely good to the entire West Haven community whether it has been half a million to the Arts Center, or \$50,000 to the Take A Seat Program, or for the Fire Truck, or to the school system with what they do for the science program. Over the next 3, 5, 10, 20 years a lot more jobs than there were at Bayer and also some incredible research done for the entire planet. Dorinda said this is an important discussion to have because we are saying we have to rush this decision because they might give the space to someone else and there is an editorial in the New Haven Register saying Yale is pulling back on their West Campus and they are stalling their project and they are not putting the people on campus. Mayor Picard said they came to see him and they were going to do a run from Yale and connect it and they wanted to know if we were going to make a decision because other entities were going to go there. I'm telling you they will turn around and say it is time for us to move on we are going to do other things.

Dorinda told Mr. Carney she appreciates the list but it doesn't have any dollar amount breakdown attached to it and they received it the last minute and we are expected to make a decision. We need to know what the breakdown is so I can understand how much it costs to modify an elevator control. Regarding the \$150,000 for ADA Compliance at Molloy and Thompson which happens to be exactly the same I don't know. I have to ask the obvious

question which is if it costs so much and we are so sorely out of ADA and Fire Code how did we let 650 children and teachers operate out of those buildings.

Mr. Carney said every single building when it is built is out of code. The code is constantly evolving and changing. If you had to bring your house up to code every time a code change occurred you would be bankrupt so would the city. There is no such thing as every building being brought up to code on a yearly basis. We are grandfathered in and when we start doing major renovations you then have to bring it up to code.

As far as the numbers attached I would have to go out to bid on every single line item to give you an exact number to the penny. He called companies and gave the board a 25 page bound report that showed \$18,000 in elevator work. To provide AC for one computer room at Bailey and three offices the price was \$36,000. He doesn't have the resources to go out and price; he is involved in about 18 jobs right now for the BOE and the City as a volunteer; he can't do anymore. These numbers are accurate within a few percentage points but to get exact accurate numbers I have to go out to bid. Dorinda thanked him and knows he is a volunteer and this shouldn't all be resting on your back. She appreciates the work he does and she is just saying if Mr. Carney doesn't have the time and resources to do it then we have to figure out another way because we do need to have accurate numbers in order to make a decision. A further discussion took place and Howard Horvath stated he thinks it is a reasonable question but he thinks ultimately the people who are going to vote – the board members will decide if they feel comfortable whether those numbers are valid or not. I think if they don't feel comfortable that they are valid based on their understanding of how it was formulated and who it came from that they will vote no. Dorinda said she is just wondering how somebody could feel comfortable without ...Howie said that is a reasonable question it will be displayed in the vote. A discussion ensued.

A discuss about the cost to operate Thompson and Molloy took place. Dorinda said if you move to Yale you still have to run Molloy and Thompson at a minimal level and that will cost us money. Mr. Carney said most of the costs come out of Molloy and Thompson because you put them in a sleeper mode you have no construction costs, your fuel bills go down considerably, your janitorial staff line item of \$111,000 disappears, the \$10,000 line item disappears, the electricity bill gets cut probably in half, telephone and communications for \$35,000 goes away, rubbish removal goes away..Dorinda interjected but you have to pay for heat, water and you have to pay security so those are costs that will still be incurred if we move to Yale.

Toni Paine said if we didn't go to Yale and stayed at the Blake Building you would still have to pay for the upkeep of Molloy and Thompson. This is not a Yale cost and I think we are losing sight of that. It's the cost to maintain the two buildings. Howie said at the end of the day I think it is what is the least expensive avenue here.

Eric Murillo said when the process started and we were going to close Thompson School there was a handout and a line item sheet which said Operation Cost of Thompson School \$180,413.00 – that is what it would cost to operate Thompson School. Mr. Carney doesn't remember that column he doesn't know where it came from...Eric said I have it right here. Mr. Carney said he has not seen that document...Eric said maybe this is why it is so important that we really study

this a little longer; we should have just reviewed this and had it in subcommittee. Toni Paine asked the date on the document and Eric said there was no date but believe me it is from here. Rob Saley said we all got it. Eric said heat, insurance, lighting, general overhead and everything else the cost is \$180,413.00. Eric asked the finance director to tell him if that is what it is. Dave Cappetta said those are the costs that related to actually operating that school for one fiscal year while the students were there for one fiscal year those were the total related costs for that building. Eric asked Dave if he could be more specific regarding operation and Dave said utilities, janitors, insurance, and maintenance. OK Eric said even if the building is closed you still have to provide maintenance, electricity, gas you might come down a little bit but you still have to provide them. Mr. Carney said there is always a cost to maintaining a piece of property. The costs go away significantly because #1 if you don't insert an Admin building into Thompson or Molloy obviously you don't incur any of those costs. If you put it in sleeper mode you remove the janitorial staff, you are not plowing the parking lot, grass cutting may be minimal, and you are not using the full potential of the boilers or the electrical panel. Eric said you would have to plow your driveway for safety reasons. You have to plow your driveway because...Mr. Carney interjected he would disagree he would plow a path to the front door but why would you plow a parking lot with no parking. You still have to plow it – not to the extent that you do now – Eric said you still have to have the lights on because you still have to clean the building you can just leave it – there are no people in there what do you clean exactly. A further discussion took place. Eric would like to know what the cost would be; you are throwing us some figures here but I don't know what the cost would be. I would like to know what the cost right now of Stiles School – what it is costing us to not run it even though we have a limited amount of space rented there. Mr. Carney said there is always going to be a cost associated with community property. That cost increases substantially when you populate the school with students and increases even more substantially when you put an Admin building in. A long discussion about the cost of the move resumed.

Eric Murillo stated his point is if was rent free he still wouldn't vote for it because he thinks it is wrong. If people ask where is your BOE its in Orange come on West Haven BOE on Orange property. Toni Paine commented that when they did the walk through they were met with a shuttle bus. She chose to go through the Orange entrance because I had the car. We were told that day the shuttle bus is available for anybody who visits there. There is an entrance on Morgan Lane with a guard post and that same shuttle bus goes to there. I asked because I wanted to know if both entrances could be used and I was told there was a third entrance on Heffernan Drive. Eric said he also asked the guard and an individual at Yale also and for a regular resident of West Haven they would need a special permit to get in the gate. If you get shuttled you have to go all the way around. The gates are restricted for certain individuals. Deliveries go to Heffernan Avenue and you have to have a special card to go through that Morgan Lane gate. I don't see me going there as a regular resident as having a special key to go through there. I don't think so. Toni Paine said that makes sense we are not in that building if we were in that building I'm sure something would be set up and I'm not going to argue the point. Dorinda Borer said she thinks it is an important point I don't think it is arguing I think we need to know how people are going to access our Superintendent and there seems to be a bit of a discrepancy. She asked how people from Allingtown, the Center, or the Shore going to come and talk to Neil at that building and talk about an issue – can somebody walk her through that process. Rob Saley said it is a very small group of people that would come into the office as a lot is done by email and phone

calls. Howard Horvath asked Mr. Cavallaro what the bottom line on the access is. Neil said we have done a pretty good job of advertising the reorganization and we can utilize school messenger. Howie said he thinks she is asking the physical way someone would be able to get in. Neil's understanding is that the guard would be given a list of people with appointments. He understands they would be willing to work with us because they realize the general public needs to have access to the building. They were going to build a gate or access to that particular building for us so they could allow access to us.

Mayor Piccard said they were going to fence off and allow access to that side. You can get into the Orange side without any access problems and they are going to fence it off so people can't get to the rest of the research facility unless there is a tour set up with an appointment. They also said to us on that shuttle bus there is a theatre there, there is an opportunity to do events there for no charge. You have the access and you can go through Morgan Lane but it is probably more difficult without question. You can go through Marsh Hill Road and cut through without any difficulty at all. Neil said that this was one of his big concerns he wanted to make sure people had access and they are very accommodating and are willing to make adjustments he believes at their cost to do whatever they need to do to allow us access to the parking lot. A discussion about the fence and other areas took place.

Dorinda asked if we had to pay property taxes to Orange based on whatever we bring with us. Mr. Carney said no. As an educational tenant you don't pay any taxes. Even if we are a sub group. That is his understanding. She heard differently and would like this double checked. She asked Rob what research was done about breaking up the Blake Building employees and placing them in other buildings. Howie said that is a two part question and the first part is about the efficacy of it and that goes to Mr. Cavallaro and Rob investigated whether there was square footage and as indicated at the bottom of this list the high school was looked at in particular and how many square feet were there – 1,000. Originally Rob thought Adult Ed worked simultaneously with kids in the classroom but he was wrong. He thought maybe they were taking up maybe 40 or 50,000 square feet during the course of the day and they don't. As stated before Francine said you could move Adult Ed Admin people somewhere but the space is too small. Howard Horvath said we did have this discussion at the last meeting and both the superintendent and assistant superintendent were not in favor of dispersing people all across the district. That is on the record. Dorinda understands they are not in favor of it but it is our vote to make and in order to make that vote I was hoping that would be one of the options. Rob said he thinks these numbers address that. Dorinda said these numbers don't address breaking employees up and putting them in other schools Rob agreed that they didn't. So it is not an option we researched basically. No it is an option that Rob looked at but we are the board and if we decide to do that then democracy rules. Dorinda said we can't make the decision unless we have the information. Howie said let me just clarify the information is pertinent if you happen to believe it is the right thing to do so in your case it sounds as if you do and other's may not based on the leadership's advice. Dorinda said if we are not going to invest in Molloy and Thompson and bring them up to code how are we going to rent it but you talked about a religious school possibly paying \$333,000. Mr. Carney said no what I said was a tenant would pay up to \$15 a sq. ft. for that facility. Dorinda said you said as a total you said something like \$300,000 that night. Are we going to invest in the Molloy building? Rob said the second part of this meeting will address that because that is my big pet peeve. To get a 5 year capital plan to see what we are

going to do with our buildings. Dorinda said why wouldn't we invest in it now? Because we don't know what we are going to do with it in the next two or three years. Howie said if somebody wanted to rent Molloy would it be out of the realm of possibility that if in fact somebody wanted to rent Molloy that they would in fact make the investment and whatever ADA compliance was involved. Mr. Carney stated they private entity may not get hit with the ADA compliance. They would do the modifications themselves absolutely. Rob is saying that if the buildings are cleared we can sit there if the second item on this meeting is addressed and we do go with something similar to this we can do a study on what we have. We need somebody is place who can do this.

Eric said we are going back and forth this is getting out of control. You did all your homework and stuff and whether I believe the figures are correct I don't think so but that is just my personal opinion. I know these figures have changed since we tried to close the schools every time I look for something it is always a different figure. Here is where I am going with this you are talking about safety, environment, air conditioning and it seems like we need to put our administrators in the Taj Mahal. You have issues with our kids who are hot and they are opening the windows because the heat can't be turned down and you have teachers that have to work in 80 or 90 degree classrooms and nobody talks about bringing them air conditioning but it seems like the administrators don't want to give at all they want to stay together. You want the community to give the teachers to give the employees to give everybody to give but the administrators don't want to move. Mr. Carney said Admin people work in July and August and you can't work in that environment without air conditioning. When you put computers inside a room and you have an office where the door needs to be closed you need air conditioning especially in those summer months. Whether you believe the numbers or not there is a time frame associated with Molloy and Thompson and any other school in the district that is made up of the architectural plans, RFQ, RFP so on an so forth which means you are forcing the remodel at the Blake Building while you are waiting to go into another school. The bottom line is that 8 months forces you to put \$100,000 into this building. The phone lines, security, wiring of the internet, talking to IT all are costs associated with this and if you break up the BOE you will have these costs tripled or quadrupled. When you start moving people around it gets costly. Whether you believe the numbers or not it is just not practical to put an Admin building in the time that you have into one of our schools.

A lengthy discussion about Molly and Thompson and the costs associated with converting them to an Admin building took place along with a discussion on the savings of moving to the Yale West Campus,

Dorinda had no further questions but wanted to say Mr. Chairman I am disappointed that a board member asked that another option be evaluated and we deferred to the superintendent who wasn't comfortable with that option and it wasn't fully researched and I think if a board member is participating and contributing and requesting that we evaluate it we should have done it. Duly noted. Rob stated again that he looked at the high school and there was only 1,000 square feet. They went to Molloy and there is a cost to build it out. Dorinda said she got that part but there are other schools and other options. By the way kids are in the schools during summer for camp and they are overheated we are not looking at air conditioning during that time frame. You didn't thoroughly research it – you talked to Pam. We are having the conversation now and that

should have been something that was part of the equation for consideration. Howie said as the chairperson that we didn't look at it because Neil wasn't comfortable with that...Howie interjected no let me correct that I said there may be members of the board that aren't concerned about that as you are because they feel that the judgment of the superintendent and assistant superintendent as to how the district will run following that kind of a move supersedes the interest of how many sq. footage is over and available at Forest; that is what I said to be clear. So that is for each and every board member to decide for themselves.

Mark Palmieri stated to Mrs. Borer and Mr. Murillo he has a solution in regard to Yale and if someone needs to see someone from this administration. I think I have a pretty good solution. Instead of the parent going to Yale we will have the administration go to the parent. If a parent from Forest wants to meet with the Superintendent the parent can meet him at the school. If someone wanted to speak to the finance director we might have a problem but I don't think he gets too many calls from the public. As far as Yale my frustration is the fact that it has taken so long. I believe there is a savings and what bothers me is that we have lost six months of savings. We have been procrastinating for what I am not sure. Under these economic times money has been lost I feel. As far as moving forward I will definitely say this and this goes back to former board member Mr. Calabritto. I am not a big fan of moving to City Hall I would really like to go to Molloy School. He said you need to stay separate from the City Council you don't want to be micromanaged by the council. I would love to use Molloy it is a great location but if it is not feasible it is not feasible and we have to move forward. I know there is that grant money out there and I'd like to find out if that money from the renovation from City Hall could be transferred to Molloy School because in five or ten years we don't know what the population of our school district is going to be and we might need that building. I don't want to stay at Yale forever but lets do something move quickly on it. Now we are under a gun to get something done. Yale doesn't want to wait for us and I also know there is a lawsuit not waiting for us and we need to make a decision. My personal feeling is let's make the move to Yale but as far as where we are going to make a permanent building my vote is going to be for Molloy unless someone can tell me it is not feasible or can't be done. I don't want to see us possibly not be able to utilize that building. I think there is a motion on the floor and I would like to move forward with this I think we have had more than enough time to discuss this over the past six months and I would like to move forward.

Sean Maher said it is obvious if we move to Yale there will be a savings. He asked where that money was going to go. Neil would like to make sure they realize any savings before they appropriate it. He does not think we are in a position to hire people back if that is what you are asking. No I'm asking a general question; its just that it is substantial. Howie said another way to ask it might be if in fact it was realized where would you spend the money. Neil said we would like to bring staff back and we really cut our facility and maintenance accounts down to the bottom and if we are going to save on facilities it might be worth putting some of the money back into our facilities.

Sean Maher stated we have yearly leases with Yale so if City Hall is ready in a year we don't renew the lease but if City Hall is ready in 13 months where does the other 11 months of payment go? Mr. Carney said you tell Yale you don't want to renew your lease. Rob said you have to give them notification otherwise you have to pay and that is a planning issue we have to

work out. It is \$754.00 a day I believe. Howie said we would notify them and we are not bound there.

Sean's main concern is that we are moving our facilities to a different town. Nobody understands better than me at this table about the philanthropy of Yale I have been working for them for 15 years. They are wonderful but they are also a business and we have to look at it that way too. I wish there was some sort of guarantee that this would all come to pass within a year.

Dorinda Borer agrees that this has taken a long time. Six months is a long time but I think understandably moving our administration to Yale took a back seat to our restructuring and our budget crisis and I think in all fairness to everybody I think that is why it is been prolonged. We had more pressing issues to address.

Mr. Saley said he doesn't think it has taken enough time we have discussed it at ends. My good friend over there has berated me both here and there because he thought it has taken too long but I think the dialogue is what we need and like Mrs. Borer says if we were to vote in January I think we would have been there already but we did have a budgetary crisis. So I think to say that it has taken too long isn't a bad thing because in three weeks hopefully we don't have any more budgetary crisis's. I know I spent a lot of time on this and I get a little mad when people say I haven't done due diligence. Did I look at every school; no. Did I have the time to look at every school; no I don't I do have a full time job actually two jobs so it is hard. I try to work with Mr. Carney, the chairman and Neil and I called the guy from Yale and was reprimanded for calling him but I got over it. That is OK I just wanted to keep the lines of communication open and he was right to do it. We have dissected this and I think the right decision in my opinion six months ago was to move to Yale but when we looked at all the numbers over the last three or four months I flip flopped so when I look at the numbers now I still believe the savings is there so I think six months is a long time but I think it was right and we all had enough time to base our decisions on.

A further discussion took place.

Howard Horvath would like to conclude and add that he appreciates all the work that Rob Saley did beginning before the crisis of the budget and our reorganization. He also thanked Mr. Carney for spending a lot of time to come up with this information and for spending a lot of time this evening to talk about it with us. Howie brought the motion for a temporary move of the BOE to the Yale West Campus to a vote.

A role call vote was requested.

Eric Murillo voted no to the move to Yale West Campus

Toni Paine voted yes to the move to Yale West Campus

Dorinda Borer voted no to the move to Yale West Campus

Mark Palmieri voted yes to the move to Yale West Campus

Rob Saley voted yes to the move to Yale West Campus

Sean Maher voted no to the move to Yale West Campus

Howard Horvath voted yes to the move to Yale West Campus

The motion carried.

Howard Horvath thanked the board and went on to the next agenda item.

Howard Horvath requested a motion to distribute the RFP regarding facilities management.

Mark Palmieri made the motion to distribute the RFP regarding facilities management.

Rob Saley seconded the motion.

Discussion: Sean Maher would like to see the RFP that we are sending not someone else's RFP. Howie asked Rob Saley if he had received the feedback from the board members. Eric Murillo thought we were going to discuss this part of the agenda. Can we ask questions of individuals because I want to hear from the committee? I thought we were going to have a facilities management committee meeting. Howie asked if there were people in particular that he wanted to ask questions of? Yes maybe the union and people that do work for the system. Howie asked the board in the context of our discussion can we in fact invite them to answer questions? Howie said yes that is fine. The question is what modifications to this, and this will come from our discussion, if any other than the obvious one, need to be made before we can have this go out as an RFP. Sean Maher said if we are going to vote for something to go out I would like to see the actual document we are sending. Howie said that is fine. Eric said the point was we were going to discuss this with the committee beforehand. What was the point in bringing the committee together if we weren't going to discuss it with them? Then we were going to make up our own RFP so we could submit it to whoever wants to apply for it. That was my understanding. There are going to be a lot of questions here.

Howard Horvath said this was distributed with the understanding that we were to make comments and provide feedback to you Mr. Saley by Saturday of this week. Did you get feedback? Yes. Are those recognized in anyway formal or otherwise? Rob said Mr. Mulligan and Mr. Limosani had a list of items and they have a lot of input and I think they should be part of the process since they did spend their time and I know Mr. Mulligan dropped it off at my house around 10:00 PM. Howie asked then do we want to rescind the motion to take action on this RFP? No we can still take action on it with their input. Howie said the question is what in fact represents the RFP that you put out. My idea was we were going to sit here and look at it. These gentlemen went through it line item by line item and changed some numbers etc. and mesh it together. Howie asked Rob if given the feedback you received have you been able to modify the existing sample? Did you take the information they provided you and look at the existing RFP and change it in any way? Rob said he changed some of it yes; it's my changes. OK. Howie said it's based on their input though. Not all of it because there are questions involved. Will you address what they asked us to change and read that to us on a page by page basis; just their piece; not their list of comments just what changed this document.

The first question presented to Rob from Mr. Mulligan and Mr. Limosani was what happens if we hire a new facilities management team what happens to Mike McGrath and Joe Yacono's positions down the road. Howie said we can address all questions but asked for the fundamental changes to the RFP other than the name and address that they suggested in their input. Rob would have to go through it again. Ray Mulligan said he can answer the question if you would like me to. Howie asked if he had made changes to the document. Mr. Mulligan said he can answer the question you just asked Mr. Saley. Howie said no, that is not what I'm asking you. Some of the questions from Rob – Page 7 Preventative Maintenance - If the company who becomes the facilities manger did get terminated would the software become our property to use

for our preventative maintenance. Is that something we can do in house without buying something from a management company? Dorinda said she doesn't know why we can't do it all in house. Rob understands the point that some of the stuff we can do in house but I'm not sure we have. Rather than cut out some of the items I think it better to have an all encompassing proposal to put out to see what companies can and can not do. Two things that stick out under Energy Control on Page 8 I would like to add E – Institute a recycling program in all buildings. Mr. Carney said when the three companies were interviewed they had instituted recycling policy in every building they went to. Rob said its not it this proposal and I would like to add that. Howie said he would count on Rob to duly note this and add it. Rob would also add under Page 8 and F under 7 to consider spec out and discuss alternative energy usage as a pilot program for one building for future implementation in all buildings if deemed feasible. Under Reports (there were four pages) as an analogy when you go to the sewer commission there is a gentlemen that comes on a monthly basis and explains in detail what they have done. Obviously it is one building vs. nine buildings but I think as a board it would be best to understand a school maintenance activity report on a monthly basis. I would like to know what are our maintenance costs are on a monthly basis for each school because ultimately we want to look at what each building costs us to run. Under Safety and Compliance or under OSHA I would like to add #10 saying that knowing what the cost would be to upgrade all buildings to be ADA compliant. Neil thought that would be in the long term capital plan. Mr. Carney said that would be a huge cost. Under Termination Clause page 2 if either party fails to comply with any of the obligations....you can just automatically say 10 days to failure? Is that how that works. Mr. Carney said yes with this exception. We negotiated a 30 day cancellation cost. We would review the performance on a 30 day basis not 60. Rob asked if there was a buy out. Mr. Carney said no we write the contract and there would be no financial penalty.

Eric Murillo said we have been doing all this, and the move to Yale which the board members have just approved, because of the safety of the building. What do we tell the parents who are in wheel chairs and want to go to their child's classroom and they can't get up there if we aren't going to work on ADA Compliance. How are we going to address this? Howie said Mr. Murillo you are asking the board that question – Mr. Carney. Howie said it is not for him to decide he is just telling you that it will cost a lot of money. It is for us as a board to decide if we want to spend that money. That is what I am suggesting. It is a good question but I want you to direct it to the decision makers here.

Dorinda knows we are only voting to put this out to bid we are not voting to do this but where are we going to get the money no matter how much it costs to pay for this anybody can answer. Neil said he believes we will have the money. He anticipates the retirement of Mr. Yacono which is one of the reasons we need to act as expediently as possible. I think that money would cover the cost. I believe that salary would be put toward the bulk of the cost. Howie asked Mr. Carney if he did not suggest that there might be some additional savings if we renegotiated contracts with outside vendors. Yes, historically these companies save four times what we pay them in a district like ours. Rob wanted to make sure that contract negotiations are with the outside vendors not the employees. Dorinda said are we saying this would replace Joe Yacono? Yes. OK we said no employee would lose their job. Neil said that job is no longer a union employee. He wouldn't be losing his job he would be retiring. It's a vacancy whether there is a body in there or not. So nobody is going to lose their job is different than eliminating a position.

Absolutely. Toni Paine said they had gone to arbitration on that the year before last and arbitration found that his job (that position) was in tact in the union until he retired. Once he retired it is out of the union. Howie thanked her for that information. A further discussion about Joe's salary benefits and sick time took place.

Dorinda asked if we got any example contracts from any cities just to get a feel for it and she thought we would like to look at what an end result looks like before we see what our RFP looks like. I don't know if this is going to cost \$300,000. Howie said we were going to get this out to get some of the clarity around what it costs. He recognizes we need not act on it but if you are suggesting a contract would be helpful that is a fair suggestion.

Neil said one of the advantages of doing an RFP as opposed to a competitive bid is then you would have the right to go back and negotiate with the company. Howie said for a final contract yes.

Dorinda said it seems like we have people in place that are here to do their job, we have supervisors in place to make sure that group is doing their job. The administration is in place to make sure the supervisors are doing their job. We have a building oversight committee that is just advisory and I'm still figuring that role out a little bit. We already have four layers to get the job done and to me this is just an expensive way to bring in another layer of government that is going to make people accountable. I think we should be addressing deficiencies in house before we decide to spend money to bring somebody else in to do a job that we should be doing.

Neil said he has been in his job for approximately two years and sees this as a big deficiency. He doesn't think we are running as efficiently as we can. This department can be more productive. I see that is the reason why we should proceed with this as soon as possible because there are things that can be done like a computerized work order system, like more energy efficient studies, like the five year capital improvement plan. These things have not been getting done and have been neglected. I'm not looking to add layers I'm looking to plug a hole where I see a big need in this school system right now. You can save a lot of money and I wouldn't enter into a contract unless I was pretty assured that I would be able to do that.

Eric Murillo said they are talking about energy savings are they going to tell us how much it will cost and how much it will save us to modify building. We know we have issues with the buildings and it will cost us a lot of money to fix them so I'm trying to see where the savings are going to come from. Howie said it is not clear and that was why we wanted to go to the next step which is a non binding step just to have the potential providers of whatever saving and services tell us what they could tell us in a formal way. We may not be able to do that tonight that is fine but I think that was the thinking around it to be able to answer that question. Until they present it to you specifically you are left guessing. Eric stated he would like to hear what Mr. Mulligan is going to say because it will affect him. Rob Saley said putting a proposal out is not going to affect anybody. If there is a cost associated with this it is very nominal; its papers, it's the decision of the board once the proposal comes back to decide whether or not they want to go with it. If there is no cost savings there then there is no sense in doing it and we have to revamp the system we have. This will not affect people right now and I want to make sure we are clear.

Toni Paine thought that the purpose of the RFP was to give us information which would answer most of the question we have asked here this evening so we can make an intelligent decision. We are not going to know if this is something we want to do or not to do until we get facts, figures and sample contracts. That was Howie's understanding as well.

Ray Mulligan said it was his understanding that he was asked to give suggestions and/or questions to Mr. Saley that would be discussed before the RFP went out; that was his understanding which is a little different from Mrs. Paine's. Howie said to go ahead and present his points.

He asked to have the RFP that every board member received submitted into the record. Page 5 of the sample. We already discussed cost. Page 5 fourth paragraph – your present management and skilled tradesmen can provide all of this information. Mr. Carney knows this first hand and he has stated so publicly. This is already being done and has been stated so publicly by the people in place right now. Rob asked if there was something specific you wanted to change in this. Ray said it doesn't have to be in there. This is a reason you don't need these people. Eric asked if these reports were brought to the BOE. Howie said he has not seen them. Ray said there is no such thing as reports mentioned Mr. Murillo. The reports are the last eight pages and Mr. Saley has already mentioned this. This is administration and technical direction in the management of the maintenance department. Howie said duly noted thank you.

B. Page 5 Cost Effective Maintenance Resource Management – this already exists; every single one of those things. I've been here 22 years and it has always existed. The cost of such modifications – maintenance of energy, gas, fuel etc. is all on record you get bills for that. In my opinion this is a duplication of services.

C. Safety and Compliance – except for the word Pennsylvania in there we have a safety committee which recommends not just the maintenance department there is a safety committee in the BOE chaired by Donna Kosiorowski and Jolene Barnes which does all these things. Another duplication of services at least in my opinion.

Dorinda asked if that safety compliance group meets on a regular basis and provides reports and makes recommendations. Yes four times a year. The members on this committee have representatives from various places the co-chair people are Donna Kosiorowski, the head nurse and Jolene Barnes, Personnel Director and they have teacher representatives, maintenance representatives, administrative representatives, it is about a 12 or 14 person committee.

Page 3 Definition of Maintenance Activities – The minor maintenance in section 2 is already done. Minor repairs are already done. It goes on to say that major repairs to systems such as failed chillers, boilers and roofs do not fall within the day to day responsibility of this facility management group but require board approval because of the cost. The same thing happens now. A boiler goes down like at Washington School and they have to come through the BOE to get the things capped off or shut down. Another duplication of services.

Preventive Maintenance – regularly schedule maintenance of all mechanical systems within or on school property. Replacing filters, bearings etc. – Some of this is done in house without a service contract. Another duplication of services.

Pages 10 to 13 Reports to be supplied by the contractor – Mr. Saley spoke somewhat to this. 10 to 13 are all different reports that this management company is supposed to provide; four pages of them. I think this could be solved simply by getting a program written by the tech people who already are employees of the BOE and make the maintenance department a little more computer savvy like they do with teachers and everybody else who has worked in the BOE since I have been here. I am not savvy on a computer but I'm sure I could do those reports after a week if I had the right program. That is a suggestion.

Page 6 D#1 A – Administer and direct the Maintenance employees – If I'm not mistaken everyone on this board said this person was only going to direct the maintenance supervisors. This should be taken out.

Page 6 D#1 B – Maintain a written record of employee performance, qualifications, and specialized training. These things are already done in accordance with BOE policy in the personnel department.

Page 6 D#1 C – Maintain OSHA Records – already done.

Page 6 D#1 E – Direct and supervise Maintenance Employees - We were told by Mr. Saley and Mr. Carney this has nothing to do with maintenance employees only the supervisors. This is kind of the whole thing.

Page 6 D#1 F – Complete Payroll information to the business office. How do you think I have been getting paid for 22 years? This already exists it doesn't have to be in there. These are things that are already being done now that do not have to be in the RFP. You can always take them out. Howie said that is what we are doing. Neil said you can always take them out after you write the RFP. Howie said he didn't mean to say we were taking them out we were noting them for that consideration.

Page 7 Part E Performance Review and evaluation – This can be accomplished in two minutes under competent supervision. This doesn't have to be in there anybody on this board can do this in two seconds; even I can do it.

Page 7 Part F Preventative Maintenance System #1 – Self explanatory and can be accomplished with assistance from the tech dept. and is an on-line tracking system.

Page 7 Part F Preventative Maintenance System #2 – A – already exists B – already exists C – should exist and I'm sure is does somewhere – equipment cost history and D – already exists and these do not have to be duplicated.

Page 7 Part G – Administrative Specifications – All deal with BOE authority

#3 Preventive Maintenance and Corrective Work Order System – already exists with monetary constraints from the BOE. He is sure with more money more maintenance would be done.

Pages 9, 10, and 11 exists as we speak all three of them take it out.

Mr. Mulligan made a quick statement and said you all have this in front of you and at the bottom of my first statement – A clerk of the works – call it anything you want project manager, fills your needs as a BOE employee at a fraction of the cost and can handle many other things. He agrees 100% with Mr. Saley that the maintenance department can be immensely improved with computerization – all they have to do is teach them – teach me; you teach every single teacher in this system. Howard Horvath said duly noted.

Mr. Mulligan said he doesn't want to misquote Mr. Saley and at the last meeting Mr. Carney and I certainly don't want to misquote him – this has nothing to do with the non-certified union employees such as myself. I have heard that statement from half a dozen of you. If it doesn't I challenge you to sign an agreement with his local that only the BOE will negotiate our contracts while this is in place; which isn't needed to begin with. Rob said that is actually in there. Mr. Mulligan said that contract is not with us. Howie said I think he is just making a comment and it is duly noted. Rob said he thought the BOE, administration would still control it. Mr. Mulligan said yes but this thing that you just read is your contract with the facility managers you can open that contract in a minute without any input from us. Sign and agreement with my local that you will be the only ones to negotiate our contracts. Neil said he thinks ultimately they are responsible to negotiate the contract but if we were to bring in a facility management group why wouldn't we want that input when we went to negotiate the contract I think it would be foolish to sign such an agreement; that is my opinion. Mr. Mulligan stated so please don't try to say that because of the statement in there that it has no and Mr. Cavallaro just answered my question that you will take all the input from the facility management and you will not negotiate our contracts. This RFP does not forbid that. Howie understands that is what he would like on the record and he gets it. Mr. Mulligan said then I know that at least my people will negotiate with the BOE. Howie said he understands. You already have the people who with the cooperation with the BOE can and will save you money, keep the schools running, and accomplish 90% of the requirements stated in the RFP sample. He and Wayne Limosani will meet anytime, anywhere. Howie Horvath thanked Mr. Mulligan.

Howie asked for additional discussion. Eric Murillo asked if any other additional members would like to speak just to clear the air.

Sean Maher wanted to clarify what we were looking at here. It is not a company to take over our entire system. Howie said it is his understanding that none of the employees were going to be; Neil interjected he has no intention of not honoring any contract in place or replacing current employees with non union employees; he doesn't think they could do that and still comply with our bargaining agreement.

Dorinda thought originally the purpose was because they needed somebody who understood how to get external contractors and new pricing and negotiate those external contractors for us; that is what we were told but all over this it talks about assume line management duties, supervise the

employees, be the supervisor of the employees so we are looking at bringing somebody in and supervise our employees; not come in and do a study of our facilities and not necessarily be the contractor negotiators. So, are we bringing in a company to supervise our employees? Howie said that is a fair statement. Any other questions. Eric Murillo thought about that to and it is important that we listen to what Mr. Mulligan said because a lot of the things that are in here (contract) we are doing. If we don't send an RFP we won't find out what we are going to do with the things that are missing. If we get an RFP we can eliminate the things you just mentioned that can probably reduce the cost but I think we need to send out an RFP. What my hesitation is that from what happened we ended up being in a meeting where there is going to be a vote on this and my fear is that it is going to be brought out into the general board and if you have the votes you will win whatever it is that is my only concern. If it stays in the committee and we review the whole thing with the help of the individuals and we do have a certain language in there that prevents certain things from happening - we will have to decide that - then I can definitely agree on it but it has to be in committee. If it is out of committee and you have to vote on it - from what just happened today and the way it was put in I can't trust it I'm sorry. Howie said so you would prefer that this document be reworked given the input for presentation back to the board before it goes out as an RFP to get any additional outside information? No we have to get all the information for what it is going to cost but the problem is that this should have been a committee meeting or subcommittee meeting like we agreed on and it was brought to the general board meaning if the subcommittee doesn't agree on it the other board members could vote on it that is what we did just now. Howie said let me ask it this way. We have had this conversation and we commented on this document to use kind of to say what do we think about something like this going out. The purpose being to get additional outside information (EM right) to go along with our inside information (EM Absolutely) so I am getting a sense that maybe we aren't ready to send this out although we want to move relatively quickly given time frames on whatever it is we do or not do but the point there is to get external information while we are not bound to making any decision on it. That was the point to add to the conversation. The thinking was originally that we would make a motion to put it out to get that information and I'm sensing that people are not quite ready is that what I am hearing that you would rather work on this proposal?

Dorinda asked Mr. Carney if when they received a response to the RFP will it be itemized out so let's say the cost is \$300,000 is it going to be \$50,000 to supervise the employees and \$20,000 to negotiate a contract. I don't think it hurts to get information but so that we have an opportunity to say we don't want supervising our employees, we don't want them replacing this person or that person, we do like this section, we will pay \$80,000 for this section; is that the way it is going to come back? No was Mr. Carney's answer. He said he thinks what happens is the outside team which consists of engineers, professional managers, so on and so forth would actually assign people on an hourly basis to West Haven to be directed by the Superintendent as needed and there would be a cost associated with that. Someone asked if this RFP was not the contract. Mr. Carney said no it represents all the services and we get a price on that and at that point I think there would be some discussion as to what you would want to utilize and not utilize but that would be done on an hourly basis. Howie asked Mr. Carney to clarify saying it would be itemized in this response to a proposal as I think part of the question so you could look at each of the items and understand the fundamental costs. Mr. Carney said no that they wouldn't have the ability to say its \$30,000 to supervise or \$40,000 to negotiate they would give you an hourly

cost for a supervisor capped at a certain number. That number would then be utilized at the superintendent's discretion. So if the Superintendent said I'm having trouble supervising the maintenance department next month come in and give me a hand or if we had a boiler that blew up I need you guys to go over there an address that; the relationship could be that fluid. Dorinda said that is pretty open ended. Sean Maher said that all comes in development of the contract once the proposal is received. Mr. Carney said the contract in its basic form could be as simple as this – for X amount an hour you do what the Superintendent asks period. It wouldn't be that basic but it could be that basic. In other words more manpower is needed for energy conservation, for developing computer software, for developing the many contracts we desperately need in the next couple of weeks, for possible maintaining better records, looking at facility studies and looking at our equipment but that could be very fluid and that would be up to the superintendent on an as need basis.

Howard Horvath asked if Mr. Carney felt that this proposal (RFP) if changed to reflect at the very least who it is coming from will provide us the information to start to sift through that and get that answer. Mr. Carney said correct this is the best case scenario meaning you really can't add much more to this but you can always take away. If you put this out you would get a price, once you got that price then you could sit down and say we know it is going to cost X amount to achieve this paperwork what do we really need these guy for and who do we want to give it to. It is possible that if it comes back at two million dollars you wash your hands of the whole thing. If it comes back at \$50,000 with a guarantee you will save \$400,000 the first year you consider that you put it out. Eric said if it costs two million to do this whole plan you can still modify it just to do what you want it to do. You can use it training like for professional development like we do with our teachers. When they come in they provide the computer or whatever it is and we need to train the maintenance people because that is what they are asking for. Just give me the training and we will take care of it. Mr. Carney said this is like training for your teachers but it is training for your custodial maintenance staff. We have a lot of success to look at; this isn't a new experiment. The companies and towns and cities that have utilized this type of services have met with a lot of success and savings but ultimately the entire department whether it be maintenance or custodial answers to the superintendent. If he needs these guys to come in with their staff and their education and techniques, its like buying a franchise, you can tap into that resource and help him to the job better. Quite frankly I can't tell you how many schools he has gone to because of all the problems, because of maintenance issues and he has to physically get involved in which is not saving money by the way, because of lack of manpower we don't have enough manpower.

Eric Murillo said what do you mean; who him (Superintendent Cavallaro)? Mr. Carney said absolutely. Eric said that is his job as long as he visits the schools he wants to know what is going on.

Mr. Limosani asked why they can't just hire Mr. Carney. I mean he is at every meeting, he is running the show, why can't we just put him on at Neil Cavallaro's request just like whatever you are paying this attorney for – Floyd Dugas is the board's attorney and you pay him so much per hour why can't we do that. Neil said he can bid. Mr. Carney said his role will be greatly diminished if this company comes in to part time advisory if the superintendent needs them; I am way too involved I want to get out you need more manpower. I'm doing it as a volunteer

and I have a company to run. I appreciate what I have learned here and what I have done but it is getting way too crazy. Howie Horvath said Mr. Limosani duly noted it is in the record.

Mr. Mulligan said two things I assume it is in the minutes that we don't have enough manpower that is about 15 times I have heard that from Mr. Carney but we laid people off. That is #1. Number 2 is that I asked Mr. Carney last week about a tailor made, or made for ready contracts, that are on company's walls for service contracts and I asked him if he would investigate where we could buy some of these from some companies; obviously not the companies involved with us and I was wondering if he had an answer.

Superintendent Cavallaro stated that he thought that we are getting way out of the realm here. He believes we should move forward. He believes the purchasing ordinance gives him the authority as the department head because we have to comply with the City's purchasing requirements to move forward with an RFP. Certainly all the input and all the leg work that Rob has done has been very informative as has the information we received from Ray Mulligan and my discussions with Wayne Limosani and David in the past. I don't think we are going to do anything irresponsible. We will try to make a pretty good system a more sound one; a more efficient one. If we can't show a savings, if I can't deliver you a product within the budget then I'm not doing my job. He believes the purchasing ordinance gives him the right. We will certainly incorporate what we can from all the work that has been done into an RFP. Neil stated he should move forward with this as part of his responsibility as the chief executive officer and come back to you and say here is the decision I made, here is why I made it, here is the money that I could save you and here is what I believe the benefits are going to be. If I can't do that then I am not doing my job; or we won't move forward with anything; we will keep the status quo and we will go out and hire another maintenance supervisor. Neil sees this as the opportunity to bring in a facilities manager. We have a need for one. He spent time working with CWA removing that job from the union because he believes a job of that magnitude should not be in the union. He believes we have the opportunity now to move forward and put resources behind that particular position; something we don't have. I believe that the right company could come in and get us up to speed computer wise without having to do a lot of the leg work that we would have to do as the BOE. Certainly maintenance and facilities and keeping the buildings clean and up to code is a big part of our job but the primary focus should be education and if we are spending this much time on facility management I would like to see us spend a lot less time there and a lot more time on the education components. I believe if we comply with the purchasing ordinance and we do it the right way we will have a good product that I'll be able to deliver to you guys.

A further discussion ensued and Eric Murillo asked Neil if he felt more comfortable with a facilities management person with a company behind him. It doesn't mean you are going to hire the whole thing you could use bits and pieces. You can have somebody come in and do the training for the computers and use them as advisors. Neil said it would be incumbent upon him to decide how he would like to set that department of our BOE up but he would have to do it in a fiscally responsible way where he could show you where the money is and how it is being spent and hopefully be able to show you how and where we have made improvements that saved us money that we can put towards education. Eric asked if the purchasing power was up to \$10,000. Neil said we have a purchasing ordinance and my purchasing powers are less than that. Neil said the purchasing ordinance allows us to go out for an RFP and solicit the bids.

Dorinda said so we don't need to vote. Howie said it sounds like we don't. Dorinda said so that is your authority. Howie asked Neil to double check with Floyd. Neil has talked with him and with Corporation Counsel. He would absolutely like the board's support going into this and he wants their input. Dorinda said but our vote comes into play when you get the response back. Neil is not even sure it does as long as we are living within what we budgeted for I'm not too sure it does.

Howie said because there seems to be some lack of clarity on this he asked Mr. Carney if he had anything to add to that specific point. He said one of the issues they have talked about for some time is that the BOE does not have its own purchasing ordinance; something you guys desperately need. Because you don't have your own purchasing ordinance which would have to be approved by the council you have to follow the City purchasing ordinance. The City purchasing ordinance speaks to the department head and the purchasing agent making these decisions for an RFQ and an RFP and the selection process. It does not speak to the council or BOE getting involved in that process with the exception of the council's bid waiver and sole source provider as far as I understand.

Eric said that seems to be what we had for the IT Department. They went to the city and they ended up doing the same thing which now we are stuck with half a million or more of expenses. If that is the case it is out of my hands then because you are going to do what you are going to do no matter what and you really don't need my opinion. You are going to do it anyway and that is exactly what I was saying before. It was put on the agenda when it should be in a subcommittee meeting and now it goes to the whole board to make a decision. Howie said he thinks that is not what Mr. Cavallaro said.

Neil said he doesn't want to negate all the work that Rob has put into this. For the most part Rob and I have been pretty much in tune as to what we would like to see and what we would like to see in our day to day maintenance going forward and even developing a long term plan which I can't emphasize enough which we are sorely lacking here. To say that the input or the work wasn't helpful or fruitful is false. Howie said that is the point I was going to make he didn't say he didn't want the input. I think there is a question here about whether or not we need to vote on it; that is a fundamental question. I apologize in advance here for not knowing that but at this point I think we probably ought to rescind the motion and get the answer and if there is no vote required then there is none required. Eric said he would like to recruit legal council. Howie understands that Eric would like to ask the lawyer. Neil said he thinks it would be best to get two opinions; one from the Corporation Counsel and one from our board attorney. Dorinda was going to say the same thing as Eric. I think you should just go forward if you have the authority you are saying you have as you don't need our vote to go forward; but when it comes back we want to reserve the right to vote. Why would we need the city's opinion? Neil said we are obligated to follow the City's purchasing ordinance because as Ken said we don't have one so I think it would be important to make sure that we comply with whatever the Corporation Counsel's rules are according to that ordinance. Dorinda asked if we do that for everything. Mr. Carney said every purchase you make follows the city's purchasing ordinance. In governing bodies such as the BOE they do not get involved in any purchase on any level with the exception

of the bid waiver for the City Counsel. Neil said in that case that is why I would want to make sure that whatever they say our counsel then says yes.

Dorinda asked if we voted on the contract we have with the technology group. No; the City bid...Mr. Carney interjected that was a five million dollar contract with Chimet. Dorinda said no, I'm talking about the Business Network. Mr. Carney said before that it was Chimet I think it was for five million. Neil said no it was a different company. Howie said but I think the answer is yes to the other company. That is another issue and area we can address but for the moment we have a motion on the table and I'm sensing ... Mr. Palmieri said he is going to rescind his motion and he feels that it is no cost to this board or this district so I would say let Superintendent Cavallaro go ahead and get the RFP and then bring it forward to the board.

Neil said that whatever they do they will keep the board informed along the way of what we did and we will make sure that we do it legally and within the rules of the city charter and the Board of Education's rules and bylaws.

Sean Maher asked that the board receive a copy of the RFP before it goes out so they at least know what it says. Neil said that is certainly reasonable. It says the Board of Education on there; Mark Palmieri said West Haven Board of Education. Neil said tomorrow he will get the opinion first and then we will move forward and when we move forward you will have the opinion, if that allows me to move forward, and if I move forward whatever goes out you will have a copy of the entire RFP and we won't put in the entire advertising. Mr. Carney said we don't advertise. Each company has already been pre-qualified we simply give them the RFP with a deadline to return with the price. In that time period they will have the ability to come in and look at the structures, facilities, records and based on their findings they will submit a price which usually is broken down into an hourly with a cap and a guaranteed savings.

Howard Horvath respectfully asked Neil to take all this conversation into consideration as they formulate that.

Mr. Mulligan addressed Mr. Saley and Mr. Carney, who he doesn't see eye to eye with too often and they both know it, that he wishes he knew this four weeks ago; then he wouldn't have had to be involved. That Mr. Cavallaro has the authority that is fine; I wish I knew. He said he would appreciate the input. I wouldn't have been involved at all because there would be no sense. Howie apologizes if Mr. Mulligan spent time that he felt like you.... Mr. Mulligan said it's not the time; there is no sense in wasting any time I'm 63 years old. Howie said his point to him would be that he doesn't think it was wasted this was a good conversation and we got all the issues on the table; they are in the minutes and Mr. Cavallaro is going to answer some questions based on the legal counsel tomorrow and then determine what we do next. Thank you very much. Mr. Mulligan said he knows that Mr. Saley did ten times the amount of work he did on this and he thanked him for getting us onto the subcommittee even though not only were we not needed; you weren't needed.

Rob Saley would like to make sure that on that RFP the rink and stadium are put on there; I want it all inclusive. Neil said we are talking about all facilities; I don't think we should leave anything out but I don't think we need to specifically put anything in as we are talking about all

facilities. Eric was under the impression they would get the legal counsel first because if we have to come back and vote on it...of course Howie said that is the next step. Before that step the motion has been rescinded is there a second to rescind their motion. Rob Saley said he removes his second. Howie said so we will come back and address this based on the feedback from Mr. Cavallaro. Howie then asked for a motion to adjourn.

Toni Paine made a motion to adjourn
Mark Palmieri seconded the motion
All board members were in favor
The meeting adjourned at 8:55 PM

Respectfully submitted,

Marylou Amendola
Board Secretary