

WEST HAVEN BOARD OF EDUCATION MINUTES
February 1, 2010
Facilities Committee Meeting

The Facilities Committee Meeting of the Board of Education was held at the Blake Building, 25 Ogden Street, West Haven on February 1, 2010. The meeting was called to order by Rob Saley, Chairman of the Facilities Committee at 6:00 p.m. The meeting opened with a pledge to the flag.

**BOARD MEMBERS
IN ATTENDANCE:**

Howard Horvath Jr., Chairman
T. Sean Maher, Vice Chairman
Eric Murillo, Secretary/Treasurer
Dorinda Borer
Patrick Egolum
M. Toni Paine
Mark Palmieri arrived at 6:45 PM
Robert Saley

BOARD MEMBERS ABSENT: Andrew DePalma

ADMINISTRATORS PRESENT: Neil Cavallaro, Superintendent of Schools
Dave Cappetta, Director of Finance

CITY OFFICIALS PRESENT: Mayor John M. Picard arrived shortly after the meeting began

**STUDENT REPRESENTATIVES
PRESENT:**

Rob Saley thanked Tammy Mursko and Dave Cappetta for the work they did on this. This is an interesting move that we are looking at doing but it is not just the move to the Yale West campus it is the coordination with City Hall; there are a lot of questions in regard to the move to Yale West if we are going to be moving to City Hall. What is the cost of the City Hall renovations, who will pay for these renovations - these questions are all interlinked. Chairman Horvath and I spoke with Chairman O'Brien about this; we want to keep a good communication between the City Council and the Board of Education.

Ken Carney, from the Building Oversight Committee will make a presentation and Rafaella Fronc, Science Coordinator will discuss some of what Yale has done for the schools and show what a good corporate relationship we have that can be further developed.

Rob gave a run down on his thoughts and Ken Carney addressed the costs for the façade and work that we would have at City Hall. We will also talk about what the Yale West Campus has in store for us.

I looked at other properties in West Haven and Milford. The Blake building was built in 1929 and is about 19,000 square feet with poor heat and roughly 40 people in the building. We could move the people to the center of town and help the taxpayers. What we do have here at Blake that won't be at Yale is a sally port which helps in getting our trucks and equipment in here. This will be an issue which we must address because I don't know how we can use the sally port over there for our trucks and the traffic. We have problems with the heat and the elevator at the Blake Building. Ken Carney said if something went wrong it would be an expensive proposition to fix. We will be on the second floor at Yale and they are ADA compliant. We aren't voting on anything tonight we are just going to discuss it and there is a meeting coming up next Monday with the City Council that Mr. Carney asked me to attend and to discuss what we would like to do. My biggest concern is that I don't have a problem moving to Yale but I want to know where we will be in the next 6, 8, 10 months down the road are we going to be at City Hall and how are we going to fund it. The Mayor is here and hopefully he can enlighten us.

Questions about any of the three buildings were made open for discussion at this point. Dorinda said that is a very good question about City Hall – what the cost and timing is -in order to better define the temporary move to Yale's West Campus. Can we have a better idea of what the cost is and if it is just to renovate the police station. Ken Carney addressed some of the questions regarding City Hall. The State Department of Education has accepted our application for a Government Center Project and it was placed on the C priority list which would be put before the general assembly for funding authorization hopefully during the 2010 session which occurs in June. To date we spent a little over 1.2 Million Dollars studying what to do with City Hall. 350 of which was to put in the anchors that you presently see in the hallways; that was a five year plan which is now ten years old. The Building Oversight Committee investigated an anchor system that was successfully applied to a school of 125,000 square feet in Bridgeport two summers ago. That school is the exact same construction as City Hall. In 2009 the BOC asked for a bid waiver of \$8,800 to see if the anchor system would work and Aschettino & Associates stated it would work. He went on to discuss several other steps that would be needed to complete City Hall as a Government Center. The cost is roughly \$400,000.00 to restore the façade. Then final plans for the BOE to come to City Hall would have to be developed by an architect and some renovations made to the existing building. Then you would have to advertise for a contractor to build out the 16,200 sq feet BOE side and do work in the existing City Hall. The total project could be completed in roughly 24 months from today. The total cost is estimated at Four Million Dollars this is based on numbers that were looked at on other projects of the same size and type. The funding comes from three sources: Capital Improvement Budget, State Department of Education Reimbursement and the sale of the Blake Building. We obtained 5 proposals to get an appraisal of the Blake Building; the least expensive was \$3,500 to do a full appraisal. At this point we will have to go out to bid to hire a realtor to put it on the market.

Dorinda asked how they came up with the figure of \$800,000 if an appraisal has not been done yet. The official appraisal will tell us the exact number or close to it but it is fair to assume based on conversations we had about the appraisals and knowledge of other building that were sold it would be somewhere between \$800,000 at the low end and a little over One Million on the high.

Rob Saley said appraisals can be somewhat manipulated is it possible to get two of the low guys come in and give us an appraised value or should we go with just one. Mr. Carney said you will get two opinions the appraiser and the real estate person.

Dorinda said there is 17,000 square feet at City Hall that needs to be renovated but Yale has 11,000 square feet; do we need to renovate 17,000 square feet at City Hall? Can we reduce that cost? Ken said we need to renovate the entire 17,000 square feet; the BOE doesn't need the entire amount but we do need to renovate the whole thing. Does the façade need to be done in order for the board to move into the location? The façade needs to be done no matter who utilizes it. Dorinda is trying to figure out what needs to be done in order to get in there. The steps are to do the façade first and the State Dept. of Education does not recognize the façade as needing to be done and won't reimburse us for it. We need to finalize the specifications on the façade; about a \$26,000 cost and we would go before the Council to get a bid waiver for this. Then once plans and specifications are finalized we would go out to an advertised bid to find a contractor who could fix the façade. We could simultaneously be working on the inside – getting an architect to do the inventory of the 17,200 square feet and coming up with layout proposals for the BOE and some offices. A further discussion ensued. Dorinda said based on all of the various specs and phases do you have an estimated time frame? 24 months was the response Mr. Carney gave stating there is the chance that if the State does not come through with their reimbursement we will know that hopefully in June.

Rob Saley said that last year the State delayed their bonding until September and this pushes you back another three months and that is why I was looking at an alternative funding source.

A discussion on the cost of other building that were looked into and would cost more money took place.

Mayor Picard stated that in December of 2005 on the Council Agenda there was 20 Million Dollars to redo City Hall. At that point we weren't moving the BOE there. We wanted to make sure the façade was secure so we had the study done

Mayor Picard stated that Bayer left a lot of equipment there for us with no charge so the space is pretty much ready to go. In fairness to Dorinda she was not on the bus tour she was working but the rest of you were. Michael Donohue the Vice President of Yale talked about the programs they have in place and the benefits our children will receive. They want to help with our children; they will actually be there in that building with you and the opportunity to actually meet with them on a regular basis is amazing and for us

not to take advantage of this is absolutely incredible. Even if the State says we are not going to reimburse you we have to redo City Hall and the over-all plan is to get the BOE downtown. We need to have you downtown and are glad the BOE now welcomes this transition. We can get this done working together. This is not a permanent move but we can stay at Yale if it takes a little longer than two years to renovate City Hall. Over this two year period the relationships we can continue to improve on is something that we can not underestimate. The sale of the Blake Building is important. We can actually have the public meetings down town. Yale is handicapped accessible and the programs in place are incredible, it is a state of the art building. Yes, it is in Orange that is your downside but the benefits you have far outweigh anything and the fact that you will be saving money and eventually you will be saving all that money when you move to downtown West Haven. The things that you will develop in that two year time frame will be incredible.

Sean Maher said the plan states that part of the finances are contingent on the sale of the Blake Building. In the present economic climate if the Blake Building were to be sitting here vacant where would the finances come from to subsidize that amount and what is the cost to run a vacant Blake Building. Ken Carney said the cost for a vacant Blake Building is about \$35,000.00 a year. He doesn't think it is realistic to think the Blake Building will not sell and referred this to the Mayor. Mayor Picard said this is a City owned building because there are no students in it and it will sell eventually. If we don't get state aid and we don't sell the Blake Building we still have to do this building (City Hall). If it takes two, three, or four years to do this – and took short term borrowing - you will still save the money of not having the Blake Building to operate, not paying for anything at Yale West and you will be right in our own building that we own and that will help offset it. A further discussion took place.

Eric Murillo asked where is the \$4,000,000.00 going to come from. Ken Carney said we have applied to the state. The day you shut the door on the Blake Building you save \$200,000.00; that is some of the money. The Mayor said there is \$2,000,000.00 dollars in the capital budget – that is half the money. You have an asset here worth roughly \$1,000,000.00 and you have a very good shot of getting almost \$1,000,000.00 from the state. Nothing is 100% guaranteed except when you walk out of this building you save \$200,000.00.

Eric Murillo asked where is the \$2,000,000.00 and the Mayor said there is \$2,000,000.00 approved last year in the five year capital plan. That is where the first \$2,000,000.00 is. We are going to have to do City Hall the best part about this is we have the potential to get 37 cents even 30 cents or 20 cents on the dollar for something we weren't going to get before to move the BOE there. Yes we still have a deficit but approved in the capital plan was the \$2,000,000.00. Whether you sell the Blake Building or not and whether you get state aid or not we will still have to redo City Hall. If you don't sell the Blake Building and we don't move the BOE there we know the chances of getting reimbursed for City Hall are zero. A further discussion ensued.

Dorinda Borer said she wants as much information as possible to be able to make an educated decision. You say the savings is \$200,000.00 but really it is \$184,365.00. The \$35,000.00 to operate the Blake Building is not on this side of the equation so you have to take that out. That is correct. Now you are down to \$150,000.00 right. Now about the custodians for the Blake Building you have \$111,000.00 for two custodians. Correct. Yale one custodian – why would there be the change? Yale may have other answers to this but you are looking at a very clean and modern facility without the upkeep that you have at the Blake Building. Yale will be doing the in house things with their own people I assume. That is my issue I think we have to be very careful if we are eliminating a union position and there is somebody at Yale that will be doing the work. We would be outsourcing union work to other people this will become an issue. The savings is \$150,000.00 and I think you need to look at this more.

Neil Cavallaro said we would not need a custodian at night they would close at 4:00 PM and there would be no events there. We have two full time custodians now. Eric asked where is this custodian going to go. We certainly would try not to lay anyone off. Where are all the events going to take place – City Hall. This would be the Board's choice – Yes we are going to go to Yale and my understanding would be yes we are going to move our meetings temporarily to City Hall while we wait for the building to be ready.

Eric is not saying don't move the BOE downtown he said where is the money so we don't have to move at all until we move to City Hall. If you say you are going to put a band on \$2,000,000.00 you are going to borrow this money correct and you still have to operate the building and need maintenance and electricity etc. A further discussion about cost, the move, the elevator that doesn't always work, not being handicap accessible, the Yale building being in Orange, unavailable transportation to the campus, a possible shuttle bus to the campus, a roof that needs to be addressed in the near future, the beneficial impact on the city if the BOE moves to downtown, the cost of the move and the many benefits to the students and administrators in the Yale building took place.

Rob Saley said his big thing is money; show me the money and then let's see where we are going. In the meantime we can do some things if we can get the City Council to do it.

Howard Horvath - what total dollar amount earmarked for the renovation of city hall did the 37.68% state subsidy apply to? Ken Carney answered that it applied to \$2.2M dollars or a subsidy of \$836,000. Mr. Horvath responded that appears to be a significant subsidy.

Howard Horvath asked if there was urgency in addressing the renovation to the City Hall Building – is there a deadline or could this go on another ten years or more. Ken Carney said in 1988 a structural engineer in New Haven issued a report that the façade would not survive a 90 mile an hour wind gust in its present condition today. Howie asked if there were any other reasons. Not more important than that. It is not really getting worse – a little bit of movement but not a lot – but I assume if you wait another five or six years it may be beyond the point of repair then that would become an issue.

Howard Horvath asked whether anyone had conducted a study to determine or estimate what the financial impact of placing the BOE downtown would have? The mayor said no formal study has been conducted but that it would have a positive financial impact is generally agreed upon.

Mr. Horvath asked whether there is a way to feel more secure that the current estimate of the costs to move to Yale would not be exceeded. He suggested it be put in a contract in order to insure the exact price to conduct the move.

Mr. Horvath said that he's excited about the opportunity to further develop our relationship with Yale. For the last 20 years in West Haven I've seen how New Haven has benefited from their relationship with Yale and wished we had an opportunity to do likewise. Bayer's contribution to West Haven serves as another good example of the value of partnering. Maybe, given some of the questions we've heard Yale could provide some more specificity relative to what more they will do with us going forward. There are a lot of very innovative reform initiatives we're investigating for our district, New Haven's has already adopted these types of reforms and the current administration in Washington continues to fund them. This might be something that could serve as a vehicle for additional collaboration with Yale.

Mr. Murillo asked some additional questions of Rafaella Fronc relative to Yale and stated he did not think Yale would stop working with us as a result of any decision we make on moving to Yale West. He also expressed some concern about the potential of being located in a section of the building that resides in Orange. He reiterated that he didn't think Yale would stop giving to our community if we didn't move.

Rafaella answered she wasn't suggesting that but that she felt that being in the same building with them might result in their giving us a lot more and that she was just advocating for the children.

Mr. Horvath added that he felt we are now living in a New World. We have about 800 students from West Haven currently going to school in New Haven. The whole world is now "flat" and it's about collaborating with your neighbors. I think it is fair to say that if we spent more time working with Yale that there would be more benefits to gain. I think at the end of the day the question that needs to be asked "is this, as Rafaella just said, good for the students." I think that is what we need to focus on – not whether they are wearing blue in that part of the building. Is it good for the students, is it good for the school district and frankly, is it good for the taxpayer. If our board members are comfortable about the dollar amounts identified as savings, agree that the 37.68% subsidy our move would contribute is significant, and that the renovation of city hall for our use is inevitable, then I think that is where the focus should be.

Tammy Mursko gave a presentation on the cost of the work associated with the move.

Handicap accessibility – yes

Public access – yes

They will enter through the gate and drive around. They are also letting us use the auditorium for workshops and speakers, which is in the middle of the campus.

Address is a P.O. Box in West Haven. All buildings on campus use a P.O. Box in West Haven

Blake Building Expenses
ANNUAL EXPENSES

Yale
ANNUAL EXPENSES

SALARY - CUSTODIANS	\$111,786.65	SALARY - CUSTODIANS	\$55,000.00	
SALARY - SUBSTITUTE CUSTODIANS	\$10,530.79	SALARY - SUBSTITUTE CUSTODIANS	\$5,000.00	
ELECTRICITY	\$42,993.00	ELECTRICITY	Included	
WATER	\$1,446.90	WATER	Included	
TELEPHONE & COMMUNICATIONS	\$35,000.00	TELEPHONE & COMMUNICATIONS	\$35,000.00	
RUBBISH REMOVAL	\$9,082.83	RUBBISH REMOVAL	\$9,082.83	
CUSTODIAL SUPPLIES	\$12,492.77	CUSTODIAL SUPPLIES	\$12,492.77	
HEAT FOR BUILDINGS	\$25,178.00	HEAT FOR BUILDINGS	Included	
EQUIPMENT - OPERATION OF PLANT	\$656.00	EQUIPMENT - OPERATION OF PLANT	\$0.00	
REPAIR TO BUILDINGS	\$32,409.91	REPAIR TO BUILDINGS	\$0.00	
BUILDING SECURITY	\$7,200.00	BUILDING SECURITY	\$0.00	
REPAIR TO EQUIPMENT: MAINT.	\$12,164.28	REPAIR TO EQUIPMENT: MAINT.	\$0.00	
RENT	\$0.00	RENT	\$61,534.00	\$5.50 x 11,188 sq ft.
	<u>\$300,941.13</u>		<u>\$116,575.60</u>	\$184,365.53 Savings

One Time Cost	
Moving	\$25,000.00
Computer/Server/Network Equipment Relocation	\$5,500.00
ChimeNet	
Comcast	\$50
Total	\$30,550.00

Comcast would be \$50.00, we have not received a definite price from Chinnet yet but they wouldn't have to run any new wires so it would not be above \$5,000.00. The Business Network would be \$5,500.00 to relocate and to do any equipment. The things that we would be moving from the Blake Building would basically be files no furniture because everything there is furnished so there is a possibility that our own custodians can move the files.

Rafaella Fronc spoke about the many benefits to students and administrators by being on the Yale West Campus. We would build a closer bond with Yale and students would take advantage more often of the Peabody Museum, Nature Walks, Lab, etc. She talked about various members of the Yale Science Department that would be working with our

students and administrators and are housed in the Yale West Campus. Our ninth grade biology students do Project Search. Various other areas were mentioned. Her over-head will be on the website.

Mayor Piccard said that this would be a huge benefit for the children. If we don't do this for the children shame on us. We will look back on this as a failed opportunity. Yale didn't have to do this they want to do this. If we don't continue to build on this relationship it won't be fair to our children. Let's not miss out on this opportunity.

Dorinda asked what the next step would be if the council does not approve this funding. Rob said we will sit down and work out another way of funding if they don't fund it. The State says because we are category C which is the lowest one – we have a 50/50 chance. We have to think about how we are going to fund it that is the bottom line. Monday night we will talk with the council and see where we are going. The ultimate idea is to get us downtown. Rob read an article from Secretary Duncan, Secretary of Education, which talked about building relationships with corporations. Due to scarce resources it is beneficial to build relationships with corporations that can help.

Rob said there was another line item on the notice to discuss facilities management but we are short of time and asked to defer this.

Rob asked for a motion to adjourn the meeting.
Toni Paine made the motion to adjourn the meeting.
Eric Murillo seconded the motion.
All in favor
Meeting adjourned at 6:58 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Marylou Amendola
Board Secretary